Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants Paper by Thanh Vu Nguyen, Deepak Kapur, Westley Weimer

and Stephanie Forest in ICSE 2012

Gagandeep Singh

ETH Zurich

15 April 2013

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 ろのの

Dynamic Invariant Analysis

Dynamic Discovery of Program Invariants

- Execute Program on a set of inputs
- Infer Invariants using obtained traces
- Useful in
 - Program Documentation
 - Refactoring
 - Debugging
 - Verification

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

3

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

Dynamic Invariant Analysis

Daikon is widely used for such analysis

- Supports only a limited subset of Linear Relations
- No support for Nonlinear Relations
- Limited support for Array Invariants
- Contribution from the Paper
 - Polynomial (Nonlinear) Invariants
 - Linear Array Invariants
 - Simple
 - Nested

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

3

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

Polynomial Invariants

- Polynomial Equalities
 - Solve using Linear Algebra
- Polynomial Inequalities
 - Use Polyhedra
 - Deduction from Loop Conditions

3

イロト イヨト イヨト イヨト

- V = Set of Instrumented Variables at a Location
- D = Maximum Degree of Polynomial
- T =Set of Terms over V with Maximum degree D

Polynomial Equalities

$$x := a
 i := 1
 while (i <= n) {
 // lnv: x = i * a
 x := x + a
 i := i + 1
 }$$

- $\blacktriangleright V = \{x, i, a\}$
- ► D = 2
- $\blacktriangleright \ T = \{1, x, i, a, xi, xa, ia, x^2, i^2, a^2\}$
- ► Linear Equation Template: $c_1 + c_2 x + c_3 i + c_4 a + \ldots + c_{10} a^2 = 0$ instantiated per Trace
- Complexity of solving this Linear System is $O(|T|^3)$

イロト 不得下 イヨト イヨト 二日

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

Polynomial Inequalities

$$x := a
 i := 1
while (i <= n) {
 // Inv : x <= n * a
 x := x + a
 i := i + 1
 }$$

$$\blacktriangleright V = \{x, n, a\}$$

- ► *D* = 2
- $\blacktriangleright \ T = \{1, x, n, a, xn, xa, na, x^2, n^2, a^2\}$
- Construct |T| dimensional points from traces and build Bounded Convex
 Polyhedron that covers all trace points
- ▶ Boundary of Polyhedron satisfies $c_1 + c_2 x + c_3 n + c_4 a + \ldots + c_{10} a^2 \ge 0$
- ► The Complexity of building Polyhedron with k points in n dimensions has upper bound O(k^{⌊n/2⌋})

イロト 不得下 イヨト イヨト 二日

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

Deduction From Loop Conditions

$$x := a
i := 1
while (i <= n) {
// Inv: x <= n * a
i := i + 1
}$$

- Combine inequalities at loop head with found equalities
- $\textbf{ } x \leq n * a \text{ can be deduced from } i \leq \\ n \text{ and } x = i * a \\ \end{cases}$
- ► O(|T|³) Complexity but can only deduce Inequalities derivable from Loop Conditions and Found Equalities

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

Linear Array Invariants

Simple Array Relations

- ▶ *D* = 1
- Relations Among Array Elements
- Relations Among Array Indices
- Nested Array Relations
 - Reachability Analysis
 - Satisfiability Problem Formulation
 - Functions

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

3

・ロト ・四ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

Simple Array Relations

- Expand set V of array variables to V' representing elements of arrays in V
- ► Find Set of Linear Equalities *R* between variables in *V*' from traces of the form

$$A_0 + b_0 B_{j0} + c_0 = 0$$

$$A_1 + b_1 B_{j1} + c_1 = 0$$

$$A_2 + b_2 B_{j2} + c_2 = 0$$

.

$$A_m + b_m B_{jm} + c_m = 0$$

A is pivot as c_i, b_i and j_i are expressed in terms of indices of A

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

• b_i, c_i and j_i are linear relations ranging over indices of A

$$A[i] = (p_0i + q_0)B[p_1i + q_1] + (p_2i + q_2)$$

- ► The Coefficients are determined using information from *R*
- ► The Complexity of the procedure is O(|V'|³)

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲臣▶ ▲臣▶ □ 臣 = のへ⊙

Nested Array Relations

- Reachability Analysis
- Satisfiability Problem Formulation
- Functions

Gagandeep Singh

Elements of A reach elements of C through elements of B

$$A[i] = B[C[pi+q]]$$

- Elements of A are subset of elements of B
- Indices of B are subset of elements of C
- The Time Complexity of Reachability Analysis is Exponential in Nesting Depth

3

イロト イポト イヨト イヨト

Satisfiability Problem Formulation

- Encode finding Nested Array Relations into a CNF formula f
- ► We can pose

$$A[i] = B[C[pi+q]]$$

as a CNF formula f:

$$(1=q)\wedge(2=p+q\vee 3=p+q)\wedge(5=2p+q)$$

- Use SMT Solver to find Solution of f
- Same Worst Case Complexity
- Improves Performance of Reachability Analysis compared to Original method

Functions

Consider user defined functions

$$A[i] = f(C[i], g(D[i]))$$

 Consider a function f with n arguments as an n dimensional array F

$$F[i_1]\ldots[i_n]=f(i_1\ldots i_n)$$

 Enforce finite depth in Nested Array Relations by disallowing a function to appear in scope of one of its arguments

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲臣▶ ▲臣▶ □ 臣 = のへ⊙

Evaluation

- Prototype tool *invgen* in python uses Sage mathematical environment and Z3 as SMT solver
- Available at

https://code.google.com/p/invgen/

- Evaluation on Nonlinear Arithmetic (NLA) test suite containing simple algorithms and an implementation of AES
- Can find all the documented invariants for NLA test suite and 57% of the documented invariants for AES

イロト 不得下 イヨト イヨト 二日

NLA

- Cohencu
- Cohendiv
- Dijkstra
- Euclidex
- Fermat
- Freire
- LCM
- MannaDiv
- Sqrt
- Wensley
- More Info about functions can be found here

= 990

イロン イ理ト イヨト イヨト

- AddRoundKey
- RotWord
- ShiftRows
- Block2State
- KeySetupEnc
- SubBytes
- Mul
- Xor
- SubBytes
- SubWord

Gagandeep Singh

Using Dynamic Analysis to Discover Polynomial and Array Invariants

= 990

ヘロト 人間ト 人間ト 人間ト

Conclusion

Pros

- Extends current Dynamic Analysis Techniques
- Loop Invariant Inference
- Can be applied in Verification of Complex Numeric Algorithms

Cons

- May not scale well for large programs
- Effectiveness depends on quality of traces
- Does not consider certain forms of Array Invariants like

$$A[i] = 2B[100C[\ldots]]$$

3

< ロ > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ >